State Water Resources Control Board Hearing Name IID Transfer - Phase 2 Exhibit: 12

For Ident:

In Evidence:

STATE OF CALIFORNIA For THE RESOURCES AGENCY
DEPARTMENT OF FISH AND GAME

FISH BULLETIN 178

HISTORY AND STATUS OF INTRODUCED FISHES IN CALIFORNIA, 1871–1996

bu

William A. Dill and Almo J. Cordone

California Department of Fish and Game Inland Fisheries Division Retired



1997

to River and considus (1950) and Miller updated to conform ins et al. 1991).

& Hubbs³ ubbs³

Girard ard*

ssimus), his record

7 Pantosteus to a 1952) Pantosteus piebeius hecame mountain sucker tosteus sp.1 which platyrhynchus), a

he account of this

FISHES INTRODUCED INTO THE SALTON SEA

The Salton Sea, in Riverside and Imperial counties, the largest body of inland water in California, is primarily the result of an accidental diversion of the Colorado River during the 1905-07 period. The diversion created a gigantic lake about 235 ft below sea level, and about 340 square miles in area, but only about 15 ft in average depth. It is essentially an inland sea with a high evaporative rate due to high summer temperatures, a salinity exceeding that of normal sea water, and two inlets carrying wastewater.

The Sea requires a special place in this report since the fish introduced into it have been marine, or at least euryhaline (as in the case of the coho salmon and striped bass). A complete list of the fishes introduced into this very saline environment is reproduced here (Table 2). Taken from Walker et al. (1961), it includes both fishes native to California and a group of exotics, totalling 38,730 fish

As will be seen in Table 2, there have been numerous attempts to introduce fishes into the Salton Sea which would survive, reproduce naturally, and supply food and sport. Some of the earliest attempts strove to introduce fishes which could furnish food (e.g. the anchoveta), but most of the attempts were to institute a fishery for sport fishes. As Lachner et al. (1970) have said, "The Salton Sea is an excellent example of an area where there was good chance to gain and nothing to lose or harm by trial and error introductions." Even scientists who seem generally opposed to fish introductions state that those into the Salton Sea were "... probably the most outstanding examples of well-planned releases where no adverse impacts were likely..." (Courtenay and Williams 1992 following Courtenay and Robins 1989).

Many articles have been written describing attempts to introduce fishes into the Salton Sea, the organisms which are present, and their ecology. The most detailed of these is the California Department of Fish and Game's Fish Bulletin 113, edited by Walker (1961). OC (1978) presented a good popular report on the subject. Some of the problems besetting the Sea were described by Calhoun (1968, 1969), and in recent years its increasing salinity has caused a decided decline in the sport fishery—once one of the largest in California.

With respect to the introductions of fishes from Mexico into the Salton Sea, however, the original published reference appears to be that of Douglas (1953). He briefly recapitulated the history of the Sea, pointed out that prior to 1948 the only fishes present in the Sea were striped mullet, western mosquitofish, desert pupfish, common carp, and possibly some machete (Elops affinis). Some long-jaw mudsuckers which had been deliberately introduced were found in 1951. With respect to later introductions. Douglas (1953) stated, "Since 1948 four expeditions have been conducted to San Felipe, Mexico, on the western shores of the Gulf of California, by the California Department of Fish and Game to pro-

TABLE 2. Known fish introductions into the Salton Sea¹

Date Numb	er Species	Common name	Where acquired	Date
20 Opt 1929 900	Roccus saxatilis	Striped bass	Tracy, California	12 May 1
24 Oct 1929 1500) Roccus saxetilis	Striped base	Tracy, California	ts.
21 Oct 1930 . 1800	Roccus saxatilis	Striped bass	San Francisco Bay	
13 Nov 1930 500	Gillichthys mirabilis	Longjaw mudsucker	San Diego Bay	14 Dec 1
1934 15000	Oncorhynchus kisutch	Silver salmon	Forest Home Hatchery	
2 Oct 1948 43	Anchos mundecipides	Anchovy	Guaymas	***************************************
23 Dec 1948 1000	Centengraulis mysticetus	Anchoveta	San Diego ituna boat;	t cypromise and the control of the c
" 12	Caranx caballus	Green jack	San Diego Ituna boat:	
10 May 1950 5000	Centengraulis mysticetus	Anchoveta	San Feilpe	
12 May 1950 29	. Albula vulpes	Bonefish	San Felipe	
* . 2	Centengraulis mysticetus	Anchoveta	San Ealipe	15 Dec
1,	Paralichthys aestuerius	Halibut	San Febpe	
40	Colpichthys regis	Silverside	San Helipe	-
1	Eucinostomus argenteus	Spotfin mojerra	San Felipe	•
. 2	Trachinotus paitensis	Paioma - pompano	San Helipe	
. 27	Cynoscion xanthulus	Orangemouth	San Fe pe	•
14	Cynoscion pervipinnis	Shortfin	San Re pe	28 Mar
1	Gynoscion macdonaldi	Totuava	, San ^s e ne	

^{&#}x27;From Table 25 of Walker et al. (1961). Common family names are used when no specific common name is available. Common and scientific names have not been updated.

TABLE 2. (

۵1

non 18	Where acquired			
bass	Tracy, California			
bass	Tracy, California			
bass	San Francisco Bay			
iw :ker	San Diego Bay			
mon	Forest Home Hatchery			
νy	: Guaymas			
eta	San Diego (tuna boat)			
ck	San Diego (tuna boat)			
†ta	San Felipe			
ħ	San Felipe			
ta	San Felipe			
٠	San Felipe			
8	San Felipe			
	San Felipe			
,	San Felipe			
ith	San Felipe			
	San Felipe			
	San Felipe			
	San Falipe			

nes are used when no names have not been

TABLE 2. Continued

Date	Number	Species	Common	Where acquired
12 May 1950	. 1	Menticirrhus nasus	Corbina	San Felips
*	15	Micropogon magalops	Croaker	San Felipe
ur .	67	Bairdiella icistius	Bairdiells	San Felipe
14 Dec 1950	25	Mugil curema	White mullet.	San Felipe
Ħ	600	Colpichthys regis	Silverside	San Felipe
11	1	Paralichthys woolmani	Halibut	San Felipe
if	1	Scomberomerus concolor	Monterey spanish mackerel	San Felipe
•	1	Menticirrhus undulatus	California . corbina	San Felipe
u	12	Eucinostomus argenteus Eucinostomus gracilis	Spotfin mojarra Mojarra	San Felipe
16 Dec 1950	15	Mugil cephalus	Striped mullet	San Felipe
**	60	Mugit cureme	White mullet	San Felipe
a	70	Colpichthys regis	Silverside	San Felipe
lf .	i	Namatistius pectoralis	Roosterfish	San Felipe
	. 1	Menticirrhus undulatus	California corbina	San Felipe
	75	Eucinostomus argantaus E. gracilis	Spotfin mojarra Mojarra	San Felipe
28 Mar 1951	30	Cetengraulis mysticetus	Anchoveta	San Falipe
	300	Leuresthes sardina	Grunion	San Felipe
•	3	Cynoscian xanthulus	Orangemouth corvins	San Felipi

FISH BULLETIN 178

TABLE 2. Continued

			Common	Where
Date	Number	Species	name	acquired
28 Mar 1951	2	Cynoscion parvipinnis	Shortfin corvina	San Felipe
31 Mar 1951	48	Albula vulpes	Bonefish	San Felios
u	6	Anchoe mundeoloides	Anchovy :	San Felipe
• .	8	Centengraulis mysticetus	Anchoveta	San Felipe
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	5	Mugil curema	White mullet	San Felipe
0	3	Colpichthys regis	Silverside	San Felipa
*	4	Paralichthys aestuarius	Halibut	San Fel pe
e .	140	Hypsopsetta guttulata Etropus crossotus	Diamond turbot Flounder	San Felipe
4	65	Anisotremus davidsoni	Sargo	San Felipe
'n	12	Paraiabrax maculatofasciatus	Spotted bass	San Felipe
	7	Girella simplicidens	Opaleye	San Fe ^l ipe
47	2	Halichoeres (?)	Wrasee	San Feiipe
н .	500	Cynoscion xanthulus C. othonopterus	Orangemouth corvina Scalyfin corvina	San Felipe
		C. pervipinnis	Shortfin corvins	
A .	10	C. macdonaldi Bairdiella icistius	Totuava Bairdiella	San Felips
. •	2	Menticirrhus nasus	Corbina.	San Felipe
•	1	Eucinostomus arganteus	Spotfin mojarra	San Felipe
w ,	63	Gillichthys sete	Mudsucker	San Felipe

TABLE 2. C

Date

14 Dec 19

11 May 19

13 May 19

15 Way 19

10 Mar 19!

10-11 Ma
 1955

Apr-May
 1956

San Felipe

INTRODUCED FISHES IN CALFORNIA

295

TABLE 2. Continued

Where acquired		:		<u> </u>		1011
San Felipe		Date	Number	Spacies	Common name	Where acquired
San Felipe		14 Dec 1951	72	Colpichthys regis	Silverside	San Felipe
San Felipe		11 May 1953	8000	Engraulis mordax	Northern anchovy	Los Angeles Harbor
San Felips	d	13 May 1953	44	Cynoscion parvipinnis	Shortfin corvina	San Felipe
San Felipe	Ì	P	35	Micropogon megalops	Croaker	San Felipe
San Felipe	1		4	Menticirrhus undulatus	California corbina	San Felipe
San Felipe	;	8	1 .	Trachinotus partensis	Paloma pompano	San Felipe
San Felipe		•	26	Opisthonema libertate	Pacific thread herring	San Felipa
San Felipe		15 May 1953	50	Cynoscion parvipinnis	Shortfin cervina	San Felipe
San Felipe	i	•	38	Cynoscion xanthulus	Orangemouth cervina	San Felipe
San Felipe		PI .	4	Menticirrhus undulatus	California corbina	San Felipe
		0 Mar 1955	3000	Centengraulis mysticatus	Anchoveta	Gulf of California
San Felipe	1	10-11 May 1955	114	Cynoscion parvipinnis	Shortfin corvina	San Felipe
Sar Felipe	÷.	**	4	Cynoscion xanthulus	Orangemouth corvina	San Falipe
	1.	Арг- М ау 1956	8	Cynoscion mecdoneldi	Totueva	San Felipe
San Eating	,		1	Cynoscion othonopterus	Scalyfin corvins	San Felipe
San Felipe	•	y u	1545	Cynoscion parvipinnis	Shortfin corvins	San Felipe
San Felipe	1		59	Cynoscien	Orangemouth	San Felipe

cure marine game and forage fishes for experimental plants in the Salton Sea. Approximately 10,000 such fish, of many kinds, have now been planted in this body of water." Another article (prepared by Douglas) also discussed the establishment of a sport fishery in the Sea (California 1954). Few details of the plants themselves were given in either article; pertinent ones appear below. Most of the 1953 article was devoted to an account of the recoveries that were made in 1952; bairdiella and orangemouth corvinz.

In 1956, the sargo (Anisotremus davidsom) was taken from the Salton Sea, and the shortfin corvina (Cynoscion parvipinnis) established a breeding population there for a time. These species will not be discussed here, because, aithough they were introduced into the Salton Sea from San Felipe, Mexico, they were already resident in California coastal waters. ¹⁷⁵ Williams and Jennings (1991) made the same mistake of other authors in listing the sargo as an "exotic."

Details concerning the fishes from Mexico not native to California waters introduced into the Salton Sea follow.

Mexican fishes which were successful

Bairdiella, Bairdiella icistia (Jordan & Gilbert)

The bairdiella, a member of the drum family (Sciaenidae) native to the Gulf of California, Mexico, was formerly known as the Gulf croaker.

Fifty-seven bairdiella from San Felipe, Baja California, Mexico, were planted in the Salton Sea by the Department of Fish and Game on 12 May 1950. This plant was followed by another on 31 March 1951 by the Department of 10 fish from the same place (Walker et al. 1961, p. 78). OC (1958c) stated that the bairdiella were first planted in the Salton Sea on 5 October 1950, and Shapovalov et al. (1981)—apparently following this lead—also said that it was first introduced into the Sea in October 1950. These statements are discounted in view of statements by Douglas (1953) and Walker et al. (1961).

Douglas (15 inch specimen individuals fro of bairdiella up ducing popula

The populat main role was bairdiella can; glers.

The orange Mexico, where It was first s San Felipe, Me 1953; Walker including May ently the total i were planted; i

Douglas (19 Sea, when a 2: January 1952, either in May corvina appare tinued to do so

The oranger tionized its fisling its capture 1956a, 1957c, also penetrated enters the Sea 1 that the orange

Circa 1974, coastal waters composed of it Fisheries Servi dropped becau bles, and that it 1974).

¹⁷⁴The authors' own calculation, based on Table 2, is that 27,797 fish were planted during the 1929–52 period, but Douglas (1953) was probably alluding only to the marine fish stocked between 1948 and 1953. Table 2 indicates that 7042 fish were stocked in the Sea during this period. OC (1957c) said that since 1948 the Department of Fish and Game had introduced more than 35,000 saltwater fish of 35 species into the Sea. OC (1958c) said that by the end of 1951, the Department of Fish and Game had transported a total of some 34,000 saltwater fish from the Gulf of California into the Sea. Calhoun (1968) said that some 7000 fish were planted during 1950 and 1951. As has been emphasized before, the number of fish introduced varies with the author, and—in itself—is of not much importance. The best figures we have are those in Table 2.

¹⁷⁵ Although the introduction of Sen Felipe stock into the Salton Sea was a logical move, we cannot resist pointing out that the successful introduction of sargo was not based on "logic" or "science" but on good luck or "gut feeling." See Young (1977).

alton Sea. ted in this the estabthe plants lost of the ain 1952:

i Sea, and opulation ough they e already made the

a waters

: Gulf of

planted 50. This 10 fish to bairdover all roduced of state-

h were alluding tes that since 30 saft-1951, saltwatsome before, of not

logical 30 was Young Douglas (1953) reported the first bairdiella found in the Salton Sea, a 1.75-inch specimen found on 11 July 1952, which he believed to be the spawn of individuals from either the May 1950 or March 1951 planting. Other specimens of bairdiella up to 6.5 inches were found later that year, indicating that a reproducing population had been established.

The population of bairdiella became very large in the Salton Sea where its main role was to provide forage primarily for the orangementh corvina. Since bairdiella can achieve a length of 15 inches, however, many were caught by another.

Orangemouth corvina, Cynoscion xanthulus, Jordan & Gilbert

The orangemouth corvina normally ranges within the Gulf of California, Mexico, where it is a well-known game fish.

It was first stocked in the Salton Sea on 12 May 1950 when 27 specimens from San Felipe. Mexico, were stocked by the Department of Fish and Game (Douglas 1953) Walker et al. 1961). The initial plant was followed by others, up to and including May 1956. The exact number of fish stocked is unknown, but apparently the fourt number did not exceed 272 (see Table 2). OC (1978) said that 250 were planted, this is probably close enough.

Douglas (1953) reported the first orangemouth corvina caught in the Salton Sea, when a 22-inch fish was caught in a gill net by a mullet fisherman on 17 Ianuary 1952, saying that it represented one of the original introductions made either in May 1950 or March 1951. Whitney (1961) said that the orangemouth corvina apparently spawned in the Sea for the first time in 1952, and it has continued to do so.

The orangemouth corvina became the chief game fish in the Sea and revolutionized its fishing. At first, it was difficult to catch on hook and line, but following its capture in this way in 1956, an evolution in angling methods began (OC 1956a, 1957c, 1958c). Although it is predominantly a fish of saline waters, it has also penetrated the fresh or near fresh waters of the Whitewater River which enters the Sea from the northwest (Swift et al. 1993). Prentice (1985) has shown that the orangemouth corvina will survive conversion to completely fresh water.

Circa 974, it was considered for transplant from the Salton Sea to California coastal waters by an advisory committee to the Department of Fish and Game composed of marine scientists (from California universities, the National Marine Fisheries Service, and the California Academy of Sciences), but the idea was dropped because it was considered that the Salton Sea fishery was having troubles, and that it was injudicious to draw fish from such a troubled source (Young 1974).

FISH BULLETIN 178

Mexican fishes which were unsuccessful

Although none of the fishes listed below is known to have survived in the Salton Sea, and although they were introduced using the "shotgun" method (i.e. a nonselective approach), a few notes are appended on the unlikely chance that any of them should ever be taken here. Unless otherwise indicated, all of the data concerning stocking is derived from Table 2.

"Anchovy," Anchoa mundeoloides

Forty-three anchovy from Guaymas, Mexico, were stocked in the Salton Sea on 2 October 1948, and six more from San Felipe were planted on 31 March 1951. The primary uses for such fish were as bait or food.

"Mojarra," Eucinostomus gracilis

A total of 12 Eucinostomus gracilis and E. argenteus (which is also from California) from San Felipe were planted in the Sea on 14 December 1950. It is used both for bait and food.

White mullet, Mugil carema

White mullet from San Felipe, Mexico, were stocked in the Sea as follows: 25 on 14 December 1950, 60 on 15 December 1950, and 5 on 31 March 1951.

On the other hand, Hendricks (1957) said that 105 "muller" from the Gulf of California were transplanted to the Salton Sea in 1950. He included 15 Mugil cephalus, which is resident in California and was already in the Sea. Aside from the fact that these were "shotgun" introductions, there seems to have been little point in introducing another mullet into an area where M. cephalus was already present.

"Silverside," Colpichthys regis

All of the silversides (family Atherinidae) planted in the Salton Sea were from San Felipe, Mexico: 40 on 12 May 1950, 600 on 14 December 1950, 70 on 15 December 1950, three on 31 March 1951, and 72 on 14 December 1951. It is assumed that they were introduced as forage fish.

"Flounder," Etropus crossotus

A total of 140 diamond turbot, Hypsopsetta guttulata, (which is native to California) and "flounder," Etropus crossotus, from San Felipe, Mexico, was planted in the Salton Sea on 31 March 1951.

"Halibut," Paralichthys aestuarias

One "halibut" from San Felipe was stocked in the Salton Sea on 12 May 1950 by fishery workers who were obviously unacquainted with sex. Four more from

the same pl group or aft

One "hali ber 1950.

On 28 Ma Salton Sea.

Seven op 1951.

Then kno was planted quantity of 1956, eight totuava is be ment by Asi

An unkni Mexico, was Felipe was p

One corv May 1950, to to keep him

The Salto Bay, planted Game. The major bait fit tant in the diffrom San Fe urvived in the "method (i.e. ly chance that all of the data

ne Salton Sea on 31 March

is also from at 1950. It is

follows: 25 in 1951. the Gulf of d 15 Mugil Aside from the been little was already

were from , 70 on 15 1951. It is

ve to Calis planted

1ay 1950 ore from the same place were stocked in the Sea on 31 March 1951 either by a different group or after attending a lecture on the birds and the bees.

"Halibut," Paralichthys woolmani

One "halibut" from San Felipe, Mexico, was stocked in the Sea on 14 December 1950.

"Grunion," Leuresthes sardina

On 28 March 1951, 300 grunion from San Felipe, Mexico, were stocked in the Salton Sea.

"Opaleye," Girella simplicidens

Seven opaleye from San Felipe were stocked in the Salton Sea on 31 March 1951

Totuava, Totoaba macdonaldi

Then known as Cynoscion macdonaldi, one totuava from San Felipe, Mexico, was planted in the Salton Sea on 12 May 1950. On 31 March 1951, an unknown quantity of this species was planted here, and during the April-May period of 1956, eight more from San Felipe were added. The only member of its genus, the totuava is both a good food and sport fish, and its air-bladder is used as a condiment by Asians.

Scalyfin corvina, Cynoscion othonopterus

An unknown number (less than 200) of scalyfin corvina from San Felipe, Mexico, was planted in the Salton Sea on 31 March 1951, and one more from San Felipe was planted here during the April—May period of 1956.

"Corvina," Menticirrhus nasus

One corvina from San Felipe, Mexico, was planted in the Salton Sea on 12 May 1950, and two more, also from San Felipe, were planted on 31 March 1951 to keep him or her company.

"Mudsucker," Gillichthys seta

The Salton Sea already had a supply of mudsuckers, probably from San Diego Bay, planted there on 13 November 1930 by the California Division of Fish and Game. The resident species, the longjaw mudsucker (Gillichthys mirabilis) is a major pair fish, a relatively unimportant predator, and at certain seasons is important in the diet of the orangemouth corvina in the Salton Sea. Sixty-three G. seta from San Felipe, Mexico, were introduced into the Sea on 31 March 1951.

In summary, of the entire group of fishes deliberately introduced into the Salton Sea and known to have survived until today (three species), two species were alien to California.

DISCUSSION

"Almost all human activities, from farming, lumbering and mining to creating and releasing pollutants [and nonresident fishes] make life difficult for the other organisms with which we share the planet."

-A.H. Ehrlich and P.R. Ehrlich 1987

"We choose exotics on the basis of what they can do for us and not primarily on what they can do for the non-human system."

-H.A. Regier 1968

"We of the minority see a law of diminishing returns in progress; our opponents do not."

-A. Leopold 1949

Charles Elton of Oxford may have set the modern scene for viewing introductions in 1958 in his classic "The Ecology of Invasions by Animals and Plants" (His title might have included the words "Human-assisted.") Aside from his "worst case scenarios," he painted a very gloomy picture of the future: "If we look far enough ahead, the eventual state of the biological world will become not more complex but simpler—and poorer. Instead of six continental realms of life with all their minor components of mountain tops, islands and fresh waters, separated by barriers to dispersal, there will only be one world, with the remaining wild species dispersed up to the limits set by their genetic characteristics, not to the narrower limits set by mechanical barriers as well." Since that time, the scientific community has accepted many of his remarks or opposed them with vigor

Elton's remarks can be supplemented by those of Ross (1994): "... often free of the natural predators they found at home, these [introduced] species sometimes run amok, disrupting food chains and displacing native species." In other words, the "success" of many introduced forms seems to lie largely in the absence of natural checks to their expansion. Similarly, native species are not accustomed to the introduced ones and are sometimes displaced by them. Conversely, if the introduced species is suited to its new home, it usually experiences a rapid population increase, but once local resources are depleted its numbers fall. Eventually, it comes into balance with an altered ecosystem (Flannery 1995).

Many papers have been written concerning fish introductions, and there have been many meetings on the subject. Fish introductions have been discussed on a local and on a werldwide basis. Organizations have been formed to discuss, foster, or to combat introductions. The American Fisheries Society has a special committee and an Introduced Fish Section (both authors have been members).

which has is to the manaagement in I logical Survadvocated t combat othe the introduc The Aquatic gress regard water bodie the value of

The gene field and M all introduc tise, "Harm Office of Te

There are repugnance logical poll. These authorized to the vasive—a: 1995). In there are alse generally a fauna, and are others voly promote economy.

Neverthe example, it superior to ductions w themselves troduced c duced olivinitk from acts are poduced into And even imported c foreign ste